

YELLOWSTONE'S NORTHERN ELK HERD:  
A CRITICAL EVALUATION OF THE "NATURAL REGULATION" PARADIGM.

by

Charles Edward Kay

A dissertation submitted in partial fulfillment  
of the requirements for the degree

of

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

in

Wildlife Ecology

Approved:

Frederic H. Aigner

Major Professor

Robert J. Taylor

Committee Member

John A. Bensch

Committee Member

Philip J. Vorness

Committee Member

James F. O'Connell

Committee Member

Walter S. Ames

Committee Member

James R. Shaver

Dean of Graduate Studies

UTAH STATE UNIVERSITY  
Logan, Utah

1990

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS .....	ii
LIST OF TABLES .....	vii
LIST OF FIGURES .....	xiii
ABSTRACT .....	xvi
Chapter	
I. HISTORY OF THE NORTHERN HERD: CONTEXT FOR THIS STUDY .	1
THE EARLY YEARS, 1872-1967 .....	1
NATURAL CONTROL .....	6
WHAT IS "NATURAL REGULATION" .....	10
DEFINING "NATURAL REGULATION" .....	22
STUDY OBJECTIVES AND HYPOTHESES .....	28
II. STUDY AREAS AND METHODS .....	32
STUDY AREAS .....	32
Exclosures .....	33
Aspen Study Sites .....	37
Aspen Burns.....	38
METHODS .....	40
Repeat Photography .....	40
Aspen Sampling .....	44
Aspen Exclosures .....	46
Aspen Burns .....	48
Willow Exclosures .....	50
Deciduous Shrubs and Berry Production .....	52
Willow Seed Production .....	53
Balsamroot .....	55
Historical Evidence .....	55
Beaver .....	56
Archaeological Evidence .....	57
Statistical Tests .....	58
III. ASPEN ON THE NORTHERN RANGE: INSIDE-OUTSIDE PARK COMPARISONS .....	59
INTRODUCTION .....	59
RESULTS .....	60
Aspen Size-Class Distribution and Stem Densities .....	60
Aspen Age .....	63
Conifer Encroachment .....	63
Understory Vegetation .....	66
DISCUSSION .....	70
Successional Trend and Status .....	70
Age Structure .....	70

	Understory Species Composition .....	73
	Conifer Encroachment .....	76
	Correlation Between Elk Numbers and Aspen Regeneration .....	78
	Ecological Importance of Aspen .....	81
	SUMMARY OF INSIDE-OUTSIDE DIFFERENCES .....	82
IV.	ASPEN ENCLOSURES .....	84
	INTRODUCTION .....	84
	RESULTS AND DISCUSSION .....	84
	Aspen Stem Heights .....	84
	Aspen Stem Densities .....	85
	Aspen-stem Size Classes .....	91
	Conifer Invasion .....	96
	Understory Canopy-Coverage .....	97
	Repeat Photographs .....	102
	Other Aspen Enclosure Studies .....	109
	ENCLOSURES AS A TEST OF THE CLIMATIC CHANGE HYPOTHESIS .....	115
	Utility of Enclosure Studies .....	115
	The Climatic-change Hypothesis .....	118
	CONCLUSIONS .....	121
V.	ASPEN BURNS .....	123
	INTRODUCTION .....	123
	RESULTS AND DISCUSSION .....	124
	Frequency of Stand Regeneration .....	124
	Stem Densities .....	128
	Yankee Jim Canyon Burn .....	130
	PROBABILITY OF LIGHTNING FIRES .....	134
	Flammability of Aspen Stands .....	134
	Ignition Sources .....	136
	CONCLUSIONS .....	139
VI.	TALL WILLOW COMMUNITIES .....	141
	INTRODUCTION .....	141
	RESULTS AND DISCUSSION .....	142
	Measurements Inside-outside Enclosures .....	142
	Repeat Photographs of Enclosures .....	150
	WHY HAVE WILLOWS DECLINED? .....	150
	ASSOCIATED ECOSYSTEM EFFECTS .....	165
	Effects on Beaver Populations .....	165
	Effect on Other Species .....	177
	CONCLUSIONS .....	178

VII.	SEED PRODUCTION OF DECIDUOUS SHRUBS .....	179
	INTRODUCTION .....	179
	RESULTS .....	180
	Berry Production Inside-outside Exclosures .....	180
	Willow Seed Production Inside-outside Exclosures .....	185
	Individual Plants .....	191
	Balsamroot .....	191
	DISCUSSION .....	191
	Mechanisms Which Limit Seed Production .....	191
	Comparison With Other Studies .....	198
	"Natural Regulation" .....	200
	CONCLUSIONS .....	203
VIII.	HAS THE SYSTEM BEEN AT EQUILIBRIUM BETWEEN 1800 AND 1990? PART 1: PHOTOGRAPHIC EVIDENCE .....	205
	INTRODUCTION .....	205
	RESULTS AND DISCUSSION .....	206
	Aspen .....	206
	Willows .....	229
	Conifers .....	237
	CONCLUSIONS .....	249
IX.	HAS THE SYSTEM BEEN AT EQUILIBRIUM BETWEEN 1800 AND 1990? PART 2: EARLY HISTORICAL ACCOUNTS .....	251
	INTRODUCTION .....	251
	RESULTS AND DISCUSSION .....	253
	Journal Synopses in Chronological Order .....	253
	Osborne Russell .....	253
	William Reynolds .....	256
	Walter DeLacy .....	256
	Bart Henderson, 1867 .....	257
	Cook-Folsom-Peterson Expedition .....	258
	Bart Henderson, 1870 .....	259
	Washburn Expedition .....	261
	Barlow and Heap Expedition .....	262
	Hayden Survey .....	264
	Frank Bradley .....	265
	Sidford Hamp .....	266
	William Blackmore .....	266
	Jones Expedition .....	267
	Earl of Dunraven .....	268
	William Ludlow .....	269
	William Strong .....	270
	Doane Expedition .....	271
	Tabular Summaries .....	272
	JUDGING VALIDITY OF THE REPORTS .....	274
	WHY DID EARLY EXPLORERS SEE SO LITTLE GAME? .....	281
	CONCLUSIONS .....	285

X.	HAS THE SYSTEM BEEN AT EQUILIBRIUM BETWEEN 1800 AND 1990? PART 3: ARCHAEOLOGICAL EVIDENCE .....	290
	INTRODUCTION .....	290
	ANALYTICAL CONSIDERATIONS .....	290
	RESULTS AND DISCUSSION .....	294
	Yellowstone Area .....	294
	Jackson Hole .....	304
	Wyoming .....	309
	Montana .....	311
	Idaho .....	313
	Utah .....	316
	Nevada .....	318
	Oregon .....	320
	Washington .....	321
	SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS .....	324
XI.	WHY ARE ELK SO RARE IN THE ARCHAEOLOGICAL RECORD? ....	328
	INTRODUCTION .....	328
	NATIVE AMERICANS COULD NOT KILL ELK .....	328
	NATIVE AMERICANS CHOSE NOT TO KILL ELK .....	335
	A TRANSPORTATION PROBLEM .....	347
	DIFFERENTIAL PRESERVATION OR A TAPHONOMIC PROBLEM ....	350
	ELK PROCESSING SITES HAVE BEEN OVERLOOKED .....	352
	ELK WERE A PLAINS ANIMAL .....	353
	CONCLUSIONS .....	354
XII.	SUMMARY OF "NATURAL REGULATION" PARADIGM TESTS AND ALTERNATIVE HYPOTHESES .....	356
	"NATURAL REGULATION" TESTS .....	356
	Vegetation .....	356
	Sympatric Herbivores .....	363
	Prehistoric Abundance of Elk .....	364
	CONCLUSION .....	365
	ALTERNATIVE HYPOTHESES .....	365
	LITERATURE CITED .....	368
	APPENDIXES .....	424
	Appendix A. Names and addresses of people who provided personal communications .....	425
	Appendix B. Understory canopy-coverage in aspen stands inside and outside Yellowstone exclosures; Tables 63-67 .....	427
	Appendix C. Willow Communities on the Northern Range, from Chadde et al. (1988) .....	438
	Appendix D. State tabulations of ungulate remains recovered from archaeological sites; Tables 68-81 .....	441
	Appendix E. Permissions to use copyrighted photographs or photographs held by other institutions or individuals .....	476

## ABSTRACT

Yellowstone's Northern Elk Herd:  
Critical Evaluation of the "Natural Regulation" Paradigm.

by

Charles Edward Kay, Doctor of Philosophy  
Utah State University, 1990

Major Professor: Dr. Frederic Wagner  
Department: Fisheries and Wildlife

Prior to 1968, the National Park Service contended that an unnaturally large population of elk had severely damaged Yellowstone Park's northern winter range, including aspen and willow communities. However, under "natural regulation" management adopted in the early 1970s the agency now believes that vegetation changes in the park are due to normal plant succession, climatic change, or fire suppression, not ungulates. The agency also believes that large numbers of elk (12,000-15,000) have wintered on the park's northern range for the last several thousand years. This study tested several of the major assumptions or predictions of the Park Service's "natural regulation" paradigm by collecting vegetational data, reviewing historical source materials, and analyzing archaeological reports.

The available evidence suggests that observed changes in Yellowstone's tall willow and aspen communities are due primarily to ungulate browsing, not other factors. The future of sexually reproducing willow and aspen communities on the park's northern range appears to be in jeopardy. Under current management, their extinction is only a matter of time. Moreover, entire plant and animal communities have been affected, not just aspen and willows. Historical accounts and archaeological data indicate that few elk inhabited Yellowstone prior to creation of that national park in 1872. These results do not support

the "natural regulation" paradigm. Prior to European influence, predation by Native Americans and carnivores limited elk, as well as other ungulate numbers throughout the Greater Yellowstone area.

(490 pages)