

Greater Yellowstone elk suffer worse nutrition and lower birth rates due to wolves

July 15, 2009 -- By Tracy Ellig, MSU News Service

Bozeman -- Wolves have caused elk in the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem to change their behavior and foraging habits so much so that herds are having fewer calves, mainly due to changes in their nutrition, according to [a study published this week](#) by Montana State University researchers.

During winter, nearly all elk in the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem are losing weight, said [Scott Creel, ecology professor at MSU](#), and lead author on the study which appears in the [Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences](#).

"Essentially, they are slowly starving," Creel said. "Despite grazing and browsing during the winter, elk suffer a net loss of weight. If winter continued, they would all die, because dormant plants provide limited protein and energy, and snow makes it more difficult to graze efficiently."

With the presence of wolves, elk browse more - eating woody shrubs or low tree branches in forested areas where they are safer - as opposed to grazing on grass in open meadows where they are more visible, and therefore more vulnerable to wolves.

Browsing provides food of good quality, but the change in foraging habits results in elk taking in 27 percent less food than their counterparts that live without wolves, the study estimates.

"Elk regularly hunted by wolves are essentially starving faster than those not hunted by wolves," said Creel, who shares authorship on the paper with his former doctoral students John Winnie, Jr., and David Christianson.

The decline in the Greater Yellowstone's elk population since the reintroduction of wolves in 1995 has been greater than was originally predicted. In the three winters prior to the reintroduction of wolves, elk on Yellowstone's northern range numbered roughly between 17,000 and 19,000. In the three winters prior to 2008, annual elk counts had declined to between 6,738 and 6,279.

Obviously, wolves kill elk, and direct predation is responsible for much of the decline in elk numbers, but the rate of direct killing is not great enough to account for the elk population declines observed since 1995 in the Northern Range, the Gallatin Canyon, and the Madison-Firehole herds, all well-colonized by Yellowstone wolves. In addition to direct predation, the decline is due to low calving rates, which are a subtle but important effect of the wolves' presence, Creel said.

Two studies following radio-collared elk calves found that during the calves' first six months of life, relatively few of them were killed by wolves, Creel said.

"We knew the presence of wolves caused lower calf-cow ratios, but we didn't know why," he said. "Radiocollaring calves revealed that calf numbers were low immediately after the birth pulse, suggesting that a decline in the birth rate was part of the population decline."

The birth pulse is that time in spring when most cow elk have their calves.



The decline in the Greater Yellowstone's elk population since the reintroduction of wolves in 1995 has been greater than was originally predicted. In the three winters prior to the reintroduction of wolves, elk on Yellowstone's northern range numbered roughly between 17,000 and 19,000. In the three winters prior to 2008, annual elk counts had declined to between 6,738 and 6,279. (Photo courtesy of John A. Winnie Jr.)

This suggestion was confirmed when the researchers found that elk facing high levels of predation risk had substantially decreased progesterone levels prior to the annual birth pulse. Progesterone is necessary to maintain pregnancy, but a question remained: what was responsible for the decrease in progesterone?

There were two competing theories: One suggested elk suffered from chronic stress due to the wolves' presence. In all mammals, stress causes the release of cortisol, a hormone that helps free up energy to either fight or flee. But too much cortisol from chronic stress can cause the immune and reproductive systems to shut down.

The other theory was that the elk weren't getting enough to eat because they were always on the run from the wolves and spending more time in the forest, where food is sparse compared to grassy meadows. For wintering elk that are already on the edge of starvation, anything compromising nutrition could also cause the reproductive system to shut down.

The MSU researchers did chemical analysis of 1,200 fecal samples collected over 4 years, as well as urine samples for the study. They did not find the elevated levels of cortisol that would support the chronic stress theory. However, they did find that those elk living in the presence of wolves had lower levels of progesterone, a hormone necessary to maintain pregnancy, than those elk that didn't live with wolves.

"The elk are trading reproduction for longevity," Creel said. "Elk are potentially long-lived, and many prior studies have shown that, in species like this, natural selection favors individuals who do not compromise their own survival for the sake of a single reproductive opportunity."

If predators commonly affect the reproduction of their prey, it will change the thinking about predator-prey dynamics, and might change how wildlife managers plan for the reintroduction of predators, Creel said.

"This research shows that the total effect of a predator on prey numbers can be larger than one would determine simply by looking at the number that are killed," he said.

Until now, it would have seemed obvious to conclude that a herd losing many of its number to predators would decline faster than a herd where predators were less successful, Creel said.

"However, now it is conceivable that the herd with the lower direct predation rate could decline faster, if it spends more of its time and energy avoiding being eaten and less on reproduction," Creel said.

Creel and his current doctoral student Paul Schuette are seeing if the theory holds up with other prey-predator populations, with a study of lions, spotted hyenas and a diverse array of prey animals on a Maasai Community Conservation Area in the South Rift of Kenya.

The study of Montana elk ruled out weather as the cause of poor calf production, because elk populations that were exposed to little or no wolf predation had good calf production during the study period, which was typified by winters with little snow accumulation -- ideal for elk.

The study also considered grizzly bears.

"It is true that grizzlies prey on elk calves, and grizzly numbers have

increased in the region," Creel said. "However, the increase in total grizzly numbers has mainly been due to geographical expansion, rather than increases in the number of bears in places where they were already well-established at the time of wolf reintroduction."

The work by Creel, Winnie and Christianson was funded by the [National Science Foundation](#).

Related stories:

[Elk, wolf researchers probe wildlife battlefield](#), April 19, 2006.

[MSU researcher builds better radio collar](#), July 28, 2004

[MSU research: Bull elk oblivious to danger at dinner time](#), July 28, 2004

Contact: *Scott Creel, MSU ecology professor, (406) 994-7033 or screel@montana.edu*

Glucocorticoid stress hormones and the effect of predation risk on elk reproduction

Scott Creel¹, John A. Winnie, Jr. and David Christianson

[+](#) Author Affiliations

Edited by Mark S. Boyce, University of Alberta, Edmonton, Canada, and accepted by the Editorial Board June 12, 2009 (received for review March 3, 2009)

Abstract

Predators affect prey demography through direct predation and through the costs of antipredator behavioral responses, or risk effects. Experiments have shown that risk effects can comprise a substantial proportion of a predator's total effect on prey dynamics, but we know little about their strength in wild populations, or the physiological mechanisms that mediate them. When wolves are present, elk alter their grouping patterns, vigilance, foraging behavior, habitat selection, and diet. These responses are associated with decreased progesterone levels, decreased calf production, and reduced population size [Creel S, Christianson D, Liley S, Winnie JA (2007) *Science* 315:960]. Two general mechanisms for the effect of predation risk on reproduction have been proposed: the predation stress hypothesis and the predator-sensitive-food hypothesis. Here, we used enzyme immunoassay to measure fecal glucocorticoid metabolite concentrations for 1,205 samples collected from 4 elk populations over 4 winters to test the hypothesis that the effect of predation risk on elk reproduction is mediated by chronic stress. Across populations and years, fecal glucocorticoid concentrations were not related to predator-prey ratios, progesterone concentrations or calf-cow ratios. Overall, the effect of wolf presence on elk reproduction is better explained by changes in foraging patterns that carry nutritional costs than by changes in glucocorticoid concentrations.

[antipredator behavior](#) [nonconsumptive effects](#) [risk effect](#) [wolf](#)

Footnotes

¹To whom correspondence should be addressed. E-mail:

screel@montana.edu

Author contributions: S.C., J.A.W., and D.C. designed research; S.C., J.A.W., and D.C. performed research; S.C., J.A.W., and D.C. analyzed data; and S.C. wrote the paper.

The authors declare no conflict of interest.

This article is a PNAS Direct Submission. M.S.B. is a guest editor invited by the Editorial Board.

Elk, wolf researchers probe wildlife battlefield

April 19, 2006 -- By Evelyn Boswell, MSU News Service

BIG SKY -- Cawing ravens gave Dave Christianson his first clue that something was afoot in the animal kingdom between Big Sky and West Yellowstone.

One day earlier, Christianson had spotted elk on a hill and wolves on a nearby ridge. Now he saw only ravens and wondered if their presence signaled another back country battle in the Taylor Fork Drainage.

"Most of the time, we find kills because of ravens or magpies," said Christianson, a Montana State University graduate student from Glasgow.

"We're going to see if we can go find it," said Scott Creel, an MSU ecologist and Christianson's advisor.

Christianson and Creel are researching elk in the northwest part of the Yellowstone Ecosystem to see how they're affected by wolves. From previous years, they know that wolves cause elk to change herd sizes, behavior patterns and use of the landscape. Now, the researchers are trying to understand how these changes affect the elk's nutrition, reproduction and survival.

From January into spring, Christianson lives during the week in a one-room bunkhouse off U.S. 191. He spends his days doing things like spotting elk and wolves, inspecting tracks and scrutinizing videotapes of the animals. Creel generally drives down from Bozeman every Wednesday to join Christianson on his rounds.

Every two weeks, the researchers follow elk paths through the Porcupine, Taylor and Tepee/Daly drainages, recording where the elk have traveled and fed and what plants they have eaten. Sometimes, they drop a lead ball or pound the snow with an imitation hoof to see how hard the elk had to work to get through the snow to a meal. It's all to see how wolves affect how well the elk are feeding and how hard the elk have to work for a meal.

This day was somewhat different, though. With an unsolved mystery pulling them toward Cameron Draw, Christianson slipped into cross-country skis while Creel donned snowshoes. Both wearing backpacks, they trudged and glided across a field and up a ravine. They stopped to take photos. They pushed branches aside. They finally came upon blood splatters in the snow, stiff brown hair in a hole, rumen near a log and tracks on a hill.

It was a battle scene without a body, a combat zone without troops.

"This is odd that there isn't much here," Creel said.

Christianson added, "Usually the entire skeleton is here."

Looking for more clues and additional remains, Christianson headed up the ridge where he had seen the wolves the day before. Creel clambered up the opposite side.

"One of them sat here and ate a big chunk of it," Creel yelled. "I'm going to climb higher."

Several minutes later, the researchers returned, Creel with an elk hide and



Scott Creel climbs a hill to look for more elk remains (MSU photo by Jay Thane).

Christianson with a pelvis, two femurs and part of a skull. It appeared, they said, that wolves had killed an eight-month old elk on the side of the hill. As the wolves fed on the calf, the carcass had slipped toward the ravine. The wolves retrieved it and hauled it up to the ridges, evidently still chewing on it the next day. When Creel reached the top of the hill, he found wolf tracks, drag marks and three freshly melted-out beds.

"I think they were up there eating away when we arrived or shortly before," Creel said.

Bone marrow revealed that the elk calf had been suffering even before the wolves attacked it, Christianson said as he cut through one of its bones. An elk with plenty of food has bone marrow that looks like thick Crisco, he said. This marrow was watery and deep red, indicating that the elk was slowly starving and starting to digest the fat in its marrow.

This was Christianson's fourth winter near Big Sky and his final season in the field. With results published recently in the journals *Animal Behavior* and *Ecology*, the researchers have found that the number of elk calves in their study area has declined, but not because they were eaten by wolves. Wolves, in fact, rarely kill elk in the first six months of the elks' lives.

"This year, bears were far and away the main predators in the first six months," Creel said. "That was a surprise to us, but it confirms what P.J. White and Doug Smith have also seen with wolves and elk in other parts of Yellowstone. If the calves are missing, but wolves are rarely killing them in the first six months, what's going on?"

It appears that one effect of changed behavior is lower pregnancy rates, Creel said. Preliminary data from the Gallatin Canyon, Yellowstone National Park, the Madison Valley, Paradise Valley and Elkhorn show that elk pregnancy rates have declined where wolves are most active. The elk -- especially females -- spend less time eating and more time watching for predators when wolves are around.

"They just say, 'Today the job is to avoid being killed,'" Creel said. "So they're probably not as efficient at foraging. That's what Dave (Christianson) is studying now."

Unsuccessful this time at staying alive, the elk remains they discovered represented the ninth wolf kill they'd seen in a month, the researchers said as they returned through U.S. Forest Service land to their vehicles. This area of the Taylor Fork contains approximately 250 elk.

A slideshow is located on the Web at http://www.montana.edu/cpa/gallery/060417/pages/page_1.html

Evelyn Boswell, (406) 994-5135 or evelynb@montana.edu

MSU researcher builds better radio collar

July 28, 2004 -- By Jean Arthur, MSU News Service

BOZEMAN--He has worked with muggers and gunners and now Montana State University doctoral student John Winnie, Jr. has invented his own elk-tracking device to lower research costs and improve tracking success.

High-risk adventure and a quest for scientific knowledge drew Winnie, an award-winning photographer, to MSU from Kalispell to work on a doctorate in ecology. Adrenaline and necessity had him buzzing around in helicopters helping "mug," or capture elk. He buckled radio-collar tracking devices on the kicking, bucking, ungulates that weigh up to 900 pounds.

"We were net gunning the animals from a bubble helicopter," said Winnie, now in his last year of doctoral studies. "The gunner fires a net onto an elk. The net flares out over the animal, and then the mugger jumps out of the helicopter onto the tangled animal to restrain it."

A biologist then places a radio collar on the animal, takes blood and fecal samples, estimates the animal's age from its teeth and finally, untangles it from the net--all in about a half hour.

"Everyone gets kicked," said Winnie. "It is exciting stuff, but when you consider the cost involved in studying wild animals in rugged terrain, it's mind boggling."

For four years, Winnie has worked with MSU ecology professor Scott Creel studying wolf-elk interactions in the Porcupine, Taylor and Teepee/Daly drainages between Bozeman and West Yellowstone.

To study elk behavioral and spatial responses to wolves, they needed high-tech, global positioning system collars that offered hourly tracking in addition to traditional radio collars, which require a person to use hand-held telemetry to track each animal.

"We wanted to determine where the elk were moving every few hours and needed GPS collars, which were a formidable \$3,500 each," Winnie said. "The purchase would not only consume much of the research dollars, but the available collars often failed. So I decided to build my own."

At first, Creel was skeptical. He knew they needed a better device because the commercial units did not collect data well. Some had faulty drop-off mechanisms, which meant that even if the collar had worked properly, it could not be retrieved to download the data.

"John said, 'Look, if someone can sell a tiny handheld GPS for \$150 and make a profit, then the components have to cost far less,'" Creel said. "John wagered that it had to be possible to make a GPS collar for way less than \$3,500."

Winnie constructed two prototypes on his own time and money.

"Fortunately, the components were inexpensive," he said. "These units could acquire a position in about a minute and store 5,000 fixes on board. Once I had working devices and showed it could be done, Scott came up with the money to work on refinements and go into production."

"After testing dozens of lightweight aluminum boxes, plastic sleeves and



exotic epoxy resins, John came up with a small, lightweight, self-contained package that we could simply rivet to a regular radio collar," said Creel. "John tested trial versions by soaking them in buckets of water overnight, smashing them on the floor, and freezing them at minus forty degrees. When they stood up to that, we put them on the elk, and we've had 100 percent success."

They collected more than 20,000 locations from 18 elk over the last two winters and now know a great deal about the ways that elk respond to the risk of predation by wolves. They used traditional radio telemetry to find the wolves, which had radio collars too.

The researchers currently have nine GPS collars on elk and hope to complete their study next year. By then, Winnie can add "inventor" and "Ph.D." to his resume.

Note to editors: A related story, titled "MSU research: Bull elk oblivious to danger at dinner time" is available at <http://www.montana.edu/commserv/csnews/nwview.php?article=1833>

Contact John Winnie 582-0779 or Scott Creel at 994-7033