

YELLOWSTONE'S NORTHERN ELK HERD:
A CRITICAL EVALUATION OF THE "NATURAL REGULATION" PARADIGM.

by

Charles Edward Kay

A dissertation submitted in partial fulfillment
of the requirements for the degree

of

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

in

Wildlife Ecology

Approved:

Frederic W. Hagner

Major Professor

Robert J. Taylor

Committee Member

John A. Bissnacht

Committee Member

Philip J. Urness

Committee Member

James F. O'Connell

Committee Member

Walter S. Ameglio

Committee Member

James B. Shaver

Dean of Graduate Studies

UTAH STATE UNIVERSITY
Logan, Utah

1990

© by Charles Edward Kay 1990

All Rights Reserved

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This research was funded by the Rob and Bessie Welder Wildlife Foundation and I thank its Executive Director, Dr. James Teer and the Welder Foundation for their support. While I was at the University of Montana, Dr. Leslie Pengelly introduced me to Yellowstone and I thank him accordingly. Dr. Fred Wagner first suggested that I attend Utah State University and expand upon my Yellowstone research for a Ph.D. He secured funding for this project and acted as my major professor, for which I thank him. Utah State University's Ecology Center and School of Graduate Studies provided financial support to complete this project, for which I am grateful.

Literally hundreds of people helped me with various aspects of my research. It is impossible for me, in this short space, to adequately do justice to their efforts, but they all know that they have my heartfelt thanks. I would, however, like to single out Dr. James O'Connell and his co-workers at the University of Utah's Hunter-Gatherer Study Unit for special commendation. Steve Chadde helped me measure willow communities and willow seed production in Yellowstone Park. Finally, I thank my graduate committee for their time and assistance.

At some point in an acknowledgement it is usually customary to thank your reviewers and to make a statement to the effect that any errors which remain are solely those of the author. Instead, I will close by citing a line from Hurlbert's (1984) acknowledgement "Any errors that remain are their responsibility and theirs alone," unless, of course, I failed to heed their good advice.

Charles E. Kay

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	ii
LIST OF TABLES	vii
LIST OF FIGURES	xiii
ABSTRACT	xvi
Chapter	
I. HISTORY OF THE NORTHERN HERD: CONTEXT FOR THIS STUDY .	1
THE EARLY YEARS, 1872-1967	1
NATURAL CONTROL	6
WHAT IS "NATURAL REGULATION"	10
DEFINING "NATURAL REGULATION"	22
STUDY OBJECTIVES AND HYPOTHESES	28
II. STUDY AREAS AND METHODS	32
STUDY AREAS	32
Exclosures	33
Aspen Study Sites	37
Aspen Burns	38
METHODS	40
Repeat Photography	40
Aspen Sampling	44
Aspen Exclosures	46
Aspen Burns	48
Willow Exclosures	50
Deciduous Shrubs and Berry Production	52
Willow Seed Production	53
Balsamroot	55
Historical Evidence	55
Beaver	56
Archaeological Evidence	57
Statistical Tests	58
III. ASPEN ON THE NORTHERN RANGE: INSIDE-OUTSIDE PARK COMPARISONS	59
INTRODUCTION	59
RESULTS	60
Aspen Size-Class Distribution and Stem Densities	60
Aspen Age	63
Conifer Encroachment	63
Understory Vegetation	66
DISCUSSION	70
Successional Trend and Status	70
Age Structure	70

		iv
	Understory Species Composition	73
	Conifer Encroachment	76
	Correlation Between Elk Numbers and Aspen Regeneration	78
	Ecological Importance of Aspen	81
	SUMMARY OF INSIDE-OUTSIDE DIFFERENCES	82
IV.	ASPEN ENCLOSURES	84
	INTRODUCTION	84
	RESULTS AND DISCUSSION	84
	Aspen Stem Heights	84
	Aspen Stem Densities	85
	Aspen-stem Size Classes	91
	Conifer Invasion	96
	Understory Canopy-Coverage	97
	Repeat Photographs	102
	Other Aspen Enclosure Studies	109
	ENCLOSURES AS A TEST OF THE CLIMATIC CHANGE HYPOTHESIS	115
	Utility of Enclosure Studies	115
	The Climatic-change Hypothesis	118
	CONCLUSIONS	121
V.	ASPEN BURNS	123
	INTRODUCTION	123
	RESULTS AND DISCUSSION	124
	Frequency of Stand Regeneration	124
	Stem Densities	128
	Yankee Jim Canyon Burn	130
	PROBABILITY OF LIGHTNING FIRES	134
	Flammability of Aspen Stands	134
	Ignition Sources	136
	CONCLUSIONS	139
VI.	TALL WILLOW COMMUNITIES	141
	INTRODUCTION	141
	RESULTS AND DISCUSSION	142
	Measurements Inside-outside Enclosures	142
	Repeat Photographs of Enclosures	150
	WHY HAVE WILLOWS DECLINED?	150
	ASSOCIATED ECOSYSTEM EFFECTS	165
	Effects on Beaver Populations	165
	Effect on Other Species	177
	CONCLUSIONS	178

VII.	SEED PRODUCTION OF DECIDUOUS SHRUBS	179
	INTRODUCTION	179
	RESULTS	180
	Berry Production Inside-outside Exclosures	180
	Willow Seed Production Inside-outside Exclosures	185
	Individual Plants	191
	Balsamroot	191
	DISCUSSION	191
	Mechanisms Which Limit Seed Production	191
	Comparison With Other Studies	198
	"Natural Regulation"	200
	CONCLUSIONS	203
VIII.	HAS THE SYSTEM BEEN AT EQUILIBRIUM BETWEEN 1800 AND 1990? PART 1: PHOTOGRAPHIC EVIDENCE	205
	INTRODUCTION	205
	RESULTS AND DISCUSSION	206
	Aspen	206
	Willows	229
	Conifers	237
	CONCLUSIONS	249
IX.	HAS THE SYSTEM BEEN AT EQUILIBRIUM BETWEEN 1800 AND 1990? PART 2: EARLY HISTORICAL ACCOUNTS	251
	INTRODUCTION	251
	RESULTS AND DISCUSSION	253
	Journal Synopses in Chronological Order	253
	Osborne Russell	253
	William Raynolds	256
	Walter DeLacy	256
	Bart Henderson, 1867	257
	Cook-Folsom-Peterson Expedition	258
	Bart Henderson, 1870	259
	Washburn Expedition	261
	Barlow and Heap Expedition	262
	Hayden Survey	264
	Frank Bradley	265
	Sidford Hamp	266
	William Blackmore	266
	Jones Expedition	267
	Earl of Dunraven	268
	William Ludlow	269
	William Strong	270
	Doane Expedition	271
	Tabular Summaries	272
	JUDGING VALIDITY OF THE REPORTS	274
	WHY DID EARLY EXPLORERS SEE SO LITTLE GAME?	281
	CONCLUSIONS	285

X.	HAS THE SYSTEM BEEN AT EQUILIBRIUM BETWEEN 1800 AND 1990? PART 3: ARCHAEOLOGICAL EVIDENCE	290
	INTRODUCTION	290
	ANALYTICAL CONSIDERATIONS	290
	RESULTS AND DISCUSSION	294
	Yellowstone Area	294
	Jackson Hole	304
	Wyoming	309
	Montana	311
	Idaho	313
	Utah	316
	Nevada	318
	Oregon	320
	Washington	321
	SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS	324
XI.	WHY ARE ELK SO RARE IN THE ARCHAEOLOGICAL RECORD?	328
	INTRODUCTION	328
	NATIVE AMERICANS COULD NOT KILL ELK	328
	NATIVE AMERICANS CHOSE NOT TO KILL ELK	335
	A TRANSPORTATION PROBLEM	347
	DIFFERENTIAL PRESERVATION OR A TAPHONOMIC PROBLEM	350
	ELK PROCESSING SITES HAVE BEEN OVERLOOKED	352
	ELK WERE A PLAINS ANIMAL	353
	CONCLUSIONS	354
XII.	SUMMARY OF "NATURAL REGULATION" PARADIGM TESTS AND ALTERNATIVE HYPOTHESES	356
	"NATURAL REGULATION" TESTS	356
	Vegetation	356
	Sympatric Herbivores	363
	Prehistoric Abundance of Elk	364
	CONCLUSION	365
	ALTERNATIVE HYPOTHESES	365
	LITERATURE CITED	368
	APPENDIXES	424
	Appendix A. Names and addresses of people who provided personal communications	425
	Appendix B. Understory canopy-coverage in aspen stands inside and outside Yellowstone exclosures; Tables 63-67	427
	Appendix C. Willow Communities on the Northern Range, from Chadde et al. (1988)	438
	Appendix D. State tabulations of ungulate remains recovered from archaeological sites; Tables 68-81	441
	Appendix E. Permissions to use copyrighted photographs or photographs held by other institutions or individuals	476

VITA 490

LIST OF TABLES

Table	Page
1. Northern Yellowstone elk herd removals, 1935-1990	4
2. Summary of past and present Park Service interpretations regarding Yellowstone's northern elk herd and the "natural regulation" paradigm	25
3. Location and description of exclosures studied in the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem	34
4. Location and description of aspen burns studied in the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem.....	39
5. Size-class distribution of aspen stems in 194 stands on Yellowstone National Park's northern range	61
6. Size-class and age distribution of aspen stems in 74 stands in Eagle Creek	62
7. Regeneration dates and age distribution of aspen trees within 74 stands in Eagle Creek	64
8. Assessment of visually estimated conifer canopy cover by comparing such estimates with measured conifer constancy and density on aspen belt transects	65
9. Percentage of aspen stands with conifers in Eagle Creek and Yellowstone Park	67
10. Abundance of conifer species on 2x30m belt transects in aspen stands in Eagle Creek and Yellowstone Park for stands which contained at least one conifer.....	68
11. Average percent canopy-coverage of shrubs, forbs, and grasses in the understories of aspen stands in Eagle Creek and Yellowstone Park	69
12. Average percent canopy-coverage and (constancy) of understory plants in aspen stands in Eagle Creek and Yellowstone National Park	71
13. Aspen-stand parameters and estimated understory canopy-coverage for two road-cut protected sites, Mt. Washburn, Yellowstone Park	74
14. Aspen stem density and stem height inside and outside Range Plots 10, 16, and 25	86
15. Aspen stem density and stem height inside and outside Upper Slide Lake exclosure	89
16. Aspen stem density and stem height inside and outside Mammoth, Junction Butte, and Lamar exclosures	90
17. Aspen size-class distribution inside and outside Range Plots 10, 16, and 25	92
18. Aspen stem densities and estimated conifer canopy cover inside and outside 14 Yellowstone exclosures	93

19.	Mean canopy-coverage of understory plants found inside and outside 14 aspen exclosures in the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem	98
20.	Shrub canopy-coverage inside the East Elk Refuge exclosure 1952-1987	100
21.	Shrub canopy-coverage inside and outside the East Elk Refuge exclosure as measured by line-intercept	101
22.	Proportion of aspen stands with regeneration > 2m tall in burned and adjacent unburned areas, Jackson Hole, Wyoming	125
23.	Effect of aspect on the ability of burned and unburned aspen stands to produce regeneration > 2m tall in the Gros Ventre Valley, Wyoming	126
24.	Aspen regeneration in stands burned in the Eagle Creek drainage north of Gardiner, Montana	127
25.	Aspen regeneration in burned and adjacent unburned areas in Jackson Hole, Wyoming	129
26.	Aspen stands with regeneration > 2m tall at three distances from the road, at Russold Hill, Gros Ventre Valley, Wyoming	131
27.	Aspen regeneration inside and outside the Junction Butte exclosure on Yellowstone's northern range	132
28.	Frequency of lightning strikes on Yellowstone's northern range and in Jackson Hole by 2-week periods 1985-1988	138
29.	Average canopy-coverage and plant height of woody species inside and outside the Junction Butte exclosure on Yellowstone's northern range	143
30.	Average canopy-coverage and plant height of woody species inside and outside Lamar-West and Lamar-East exclosures on Yellowstone's northern range, August 1988	144
31.	Average canopy-coverage and plant height of woody species inside and outside Mammoth exclosure on Yellowstone's northern range, August 1988	145
32.	Average willow canopy-coverage inside and outside Yellowstone exclosures	146
33.	Average height all willow species and rose inside and outside Yellowstone exclosures	147
34.	Community types found on permanent willow belt transects inside and outside exclosures on Yellowstone's northern range	148
35.	Percent willow canopy-coverage inside and outside exclosures on Yellowstone's northern range, 1958 - 1988	149

36.	Number of beaver on Yellowstone's northern range near Tower Junction 1923-1988	169
37.	Effect of ungulate browsing on shrub canopy-coverage as recorded inside and outside exclosures in the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem	181
38.	Effect of ungulate browsing on shrub height as recorded inside and outside exclosures in the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem	182
39.	Effect of ungulate browsing on shrub growth as recorded inside and outside exclosures in the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem	183
40.	Effect of ungulate browsing on berry production as measured inside and outside exclosures in the Yellowstone area	184
41.	Number of aments produced by willows on permanent belt transects and adjacent areas outside Yellowstone exclosures	186
42.	Mean number of aments, fruits, and seeds produced by willows inside Yellowstone exclosures	187
43.	Number of aments produced by willows protected from browsing for 3 years	189
44.	Sex of willow plants inside Yellowstone exclosures	190
45.	Number of aments produced above and below the browse height (2.5m) on individual willows in Yellowstone National Park near Geode Creek	192
46.	Number of aments produced above and below the browse height (2.5m) on individual river birch plants near Yellowstone's Mammoth exclosure	193
47.	Number of berries produced above and below browse height (2.5m) on individual chokecherry plants in Yellowstone National Park	194
48.	Effect of ungulate grazing on flowers of balsamroot	195
49.	Effect of plant size on berry production inside Yellowstone area exclosures	197
50.	Decline of aspen on Yellowstone's northern range as disclosed by comparing the estimated area occupied by aspen in early and 1986-88 repeat photographs	207
51.	Changes in aspen stands shown in Kittams' 1947 photo plots on Yellowstone's northern range (see Fig. 4), based on 1988 repeat photographs	212
52.	Historical evidence relating to the distribution and abundance of ungulates in the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem from 1835 to 1876: Part 1	273

53.	Historical evidence relating to the distribution and abundance of ungulates in the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem from 1835 to 1876: Part II	275
54.	Historical evidence relating to the distribution and abundance of ungulates in the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem from 1835 to 1876: Part III	276
55.	Estimated number of ungulates in the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem, summer 1989	286
56.	The relative abundance of ungulates in the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem	287
57.	Ungulate remains recovered from archaeological sites in the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem. Part 1: Minimum Number of Individuals	297
58.	Ungulate remains recovered from archaeological sites in the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem. Part 2: Number of Identified Specimens	298
59.	Comparison of the relative abundance of ungulates in the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem during 1989 (from Table 55) with the relative abundance of ungulate remains recovered from that region's archaeological sites (from Table 57) ..	301
60.	Summary of ungulate remains recovered from 210 archaeological sites in the northwestern United States	325
61.	Approximate weights and caloric yields of various ungulate species	340
62.	Number of hours an individual animal could be pursued and still yield a net acquisition rate of 2,000 or 3,000 kcal per hour if killed at the end of that time period	341
63.	Understory canopy-coverage in aspen stands inside and outside the Mammoth, Junction Butte, and Lamar exclosures in Yellowstone Park	428
64.	Understory canopy-coverage in aspen stands inside and outside Range Plots 10, 16, and 25 in Yellowstone Park	430
65.	Understory canopy-coverage in aspen stands inside and outside the Porcupine, Crown Butte, and Uhl Hill exclosures in the Yellowstone area	432
66.	Understory canopy-coverage in aspen stands inside and outside the East Elk Refuge, Upper Slide Lake, and Soda Lake exclosures in the Yellowstone area	434
67.	Understory canopy-coverage in aspen stands inside and outside the Goosewing exclosure in the Yellowstone area ..	436
68.	Ungulate remains recovered from archaeological sites in Wyoming. Part 1: Minimum number of individuals	442

69.	Ungulate remains recovered from archaeological sites in Wyoming. Part 2: Number of identified specimens	444
70.	Ungulate remains recovered from archaeological sites in Montana. Part 1: Minimum number of individuals	446
71.	Ungulate remains recovered from archaeological sites in Montana. Part 2: Number of identified specimens	447
72.	Ungulate remains recovered from archaeological sites in Idaho. Part 1: Minimum number of individuals	448
73.	Ungulate remains recovered from archaeological sites in Idaho. Part 2: Number of identified specimens	450
74.	Ungulate remains recovered from archaeological sites in Utah. Part 1: Minimum number of individuals	452
75.	Ungulate remains recovered from archaeological sites in Utah. Part 2: Number of identified specimens	455
76.	Ungulate remains recovered from archaeological sites in Nevada. Part 1: Minimum number of individuals	458
77.	Ungulate remains recovered from archaeological sites in Nevada. Part 2: Number of identified specimens	460
78.	Ungulate remains recovered from archaeological sites in Oregon. Part 1: Minimum number of individuals	462
79.	Ungulate remains recovered from archaeological sites in Oregon. Part 2: Number of identified specimens	465
80.	Ungulate remains recovered from archaeological sites in Washington state. Part 1: Minimum number of individuals	468
81.	Ungulate remains recovered from archaeological sites in Washington state. Part 2: Number of identified specimens	472

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure	Page
1. The average number of wolves killed in Yellowstone Park by 2-year periods from 1914 to 1927 and the average number of "probable" wolf sightings in the park from 1930 to present	12
2. Smoothed, historic population trends for Yellowstone's northern elk herd from 1500 to 1967 comparing the early Park Service view with Houston's reinterpretation	27
3. Location of exclosures, aspen study sites, and aspen burns studied in the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem	36
4. Locations of Park Service biologist Kittams' aspen photo-plots on Yellowstone's northern range in relation to park roads	43
5. Percent of aspen stands (n = 74) which regenerated during five-year intervals in Eagle Creek plotted with the estimated number of elk wintering outside Yellowstone Park	80
6. Range Plot 10 north of Mammoth on Yellowstone's northern range	88
7. Range Plot 25 near Yancy's Hole on Yellowstone's northern range from 1932 to 1986	104
8. Aspen belt transect (1.5x22.9m) outside Junction Butte exclosure in 1962 and 1986	111
9. Aspen belt transect (1.5x22.9m) inside Junction Butte exclosure in 1962 and 1986	113
10. Willow belt transect (1.5x22.9m) outside Junction Butte exclosure in 1965 and 1988	152
11. Willow belt transect (1.5x22.9m) inside Junction Butte exclosure in 1965 and 1986	154
12. Willows inside and outside the Junction Butte exclosure in 1962 and 1988	156
13. Heavily browsed willows along the west edge of Round Prairie, Pebble Creek Valley, Yellowstone National Park in 1949 and that same area in 1988	161
14. Location of Warren's (1926) beaver colonies on the Yellowstone's northern range near Tower Junction	168
15. Repeat photoset of a beaver dam on the North Fork of Elk Creek on Yellowstone's northern range near Tower Junction	171
16. Repeat photoset of beaver dams below Crescent Hill on Yellowstone's northern range west of Tower Junction	173

17.	Repeat photoset of beaver dam below Crescent Hill on Yellowstone's northern range west of Tower Junction	175
18.	Repeat photoset of two aspen stands on Yellowstone's northern range northeast of Tower Junction	209
19.	Repeat photoset of aspen above Rainy Lake on Yellowstone's northern range southeast of Tower Junction	211
20.	A typical aspen stand on Yellowstone's northern range showing extensive black scar tissue, induced by elk bark wounding, on the lower 2-3m of aspen trunks	216
21.	Aspen suckers two growing seasons after the Junction Butte enclosure on Yellowstone's northern range was experimentally burned	219
22.	Company D, Minnesota National Guard camp at Little Blacktail on Yellowstone's northern range in 1893	221
23.	Closeup of aspen felled by beaver on Yellowstone's northern range in 1899	223
24.	A typical 1989 aspen stand in Eagle Creek	226
25.	Kittams' aspen photo plot 11A showing 40 years of vegetation change	228
26.	Repeat photoset of tall willow communities in Yancy's Hole on Yellowstone's northern range	231
27.	Closeup of a tall willow community in Yancy's Hole on Yellowstone's northern range	233
28.	Repeat photoset of a tall willow community in the lower Soda Butte Valley on Yellowstone's northern range	235
29.	Douglas fir trees growing on the north side of a glacial erratic boulder in the lower Lamar Valley on Yellowstone's northern range ca. 1890	240
30.	Repeat photoset of conifers at Mammoth Hot Springs on Yellowstone's northern range	244
31.	Conifers in William H. Jackson's ca. 1883 photograph of Crested Hot Spring with Old Faithful erupting in the distance show evidence of human high-lining	247

ABSTRACT

Yellowstone's Northern Elk Herd:
Critical Evaluation of the "Natural Regulation" Paradigm.

by

Charles Edward Kay, Doctor of Philosophy
Utah State University, 1990

Major Professor: Dr. Frederic Wagner
Department: Fisheries and Wildlife

Prior to 1968, the National Park Service contended that an unnaturally large population of elk had severely damaged Yellowstone Park's northern winter range, including aspen and willow communities. However, under "natural regulation" management adopted in the early 1970s the agency now believes that vegetation changes in the park are due to normal plant succession, climatic change, or fire suppression, not ungulates. The agency also believes that large numbers of elk (12,000-15,000) have wintered on the park's northern range for the last several thousand years. This study tested several of the major assumptions or predictions of the Park Service's "natural regulation" paradigm by collecting vegetational data, reviewing historical source materials, and analyzing archaeological reports.

The available evidence suggests that observed changes in Yellowstone's tall willow and aspen communities are due primarily to ungulate browsing, not other factors. The future of sexually reproducing willow and aspen communities on the park's northern range appears to be in jeopardy. Under current management, their extinction is only a matter of time. Moreover, entire plant and animal communities have been affected, not just aspen and willows. Historical accounts and archaeological data indicate that few elk inhabited Yellowstone prior to creation of that national park in 1872. These results do not support

the "natural regulation" paradigm. Prior to European influence, predation by Native Americans and carnivores limited elk, as well as other ungulate numbers throughout the Greater Yellowstone area.

(490 pages)